

**POLICY ON CONFLICTS BETWEEN ADVISING AND ASSESSING ROLES IN THE PME**

It is a fundamental principle of medical student advising that students must feel comfortable disclosing matters of a personal or sensitive nature to their advisors, without fear that the advisors may also play a role in assessing the students in some way. At the same time, effective advisors are often faculty members who have other important roles in the curriculum, since this allows them to be closely familiar with students' experiences in the medical education program. The following grid outlines the potential conflicts of interest for faculty who hold both a role that involves advising students and a role that involves grading, evaluating, or selecting students. Each intersection of roles is deemed either compatible, incompatible, or a potential conflict. For compatible roles, no action is required as the faculty member is able to fully execute both advising and assessing roles without conflict. For incompatible roles, no faculty member can hold both the advising and assessing roles. For potential conflicts, faculty members must disclose their roles and provide a plan for mitigation of the conflict, as detailed in appropriate footnotes. Note that separate policies already in place address the potential conflict of a faculty member who has a doctor-patient relationship with a student and that of a faculty member who has a familial relationship with a student.

**ROLES THAT INVOLVE GRADING, EVALUATION, AND SELECTION OF STUDENTS**

|                                      |                       | Preclerkship phase                             |  | PCE phase        |                              |                    |                        | Post-PCE phase |  |               | Multiple phases     | GME  |   |                            |                  |
|--------------------------------------|-----------------------|--|--|------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|------------------------|----------------|--|---------------|---------------------|--|---|----------------------------|------------------|
|                                      |                       | Preclerkship Core Faculty                      | Preclerkship Course Director (including ITP, POM, PDWs, HST courses) | PCE Core Faculty | Associate Clerkship Director | Clerkship Director | Associate PCE Director | PCE Director   | Advanced course/clerkship director (including AISCs, subls, Capstones) | Member of DAC | Co-Director of MSPE | Clinical skills assessment faculty (OSCEs) | Residency interviewer or selection committee member | Associate Program Director | Program Director |
| ROLES THAT INVOLVE ADVISING STUDENTS | <u>School-based</u>   | Society Advisory Dean*                         | 1  | 1                | 1                            |                    |                        |                | 1  |               |                     | 1  | 3   |                            |                  |
|                                      |                       | Society Associate Director*                    | 1  | 1                | 1                            | 2                  | 2                      | 2              | 1  | 8             |                     | 1  | 3   | 3                          |                  |
|                                      |                       | Society Research Fellow*                       |  |                  |                              |                    |                        |                |  |               |                     |  |   |                            |                  |
|                                      |                       | Dean for Students*                             | 1  | 1                | 1                            |                    |                        |                | 1  |               | 4                   | 1  | 3   |                            |                  |
|                                      |                       | Faculty Associate Dean for Student Affairs     | 1  | 1                | 1                            |                    |                        |                | 1  |               |                     | 1  | 3   |                            |                  |
|                                      |                       | Faculty Assistant Dean for Student Affairs     | 1  | 1                | 1                            |                    |                        |                | 1  |               |                     | 1  | 3   |                            |                  |
|                                      |                       | Director, Office of Advising Resources         |  |                  |                              |                    |                        |                |  |               |                     |  |   |                            |                  |
|                                      | <u>Hospital-based</u> | PCE Advisor                                    | 5  | 5                | 9                            | 1                  |                        | 1              | 10   | 1             | 8                   | 1  | 3   |                            |                  |
|                                      |                       | tDP Preceptor                                  | 11   | 11               | 9                            |                    |                        |                | 1  |               |                     | 1  | 3   |                            |                  |
|                                      |                       | Specialty Advisor (for residency applications) | 6  | 6                | 6                            | 6                  | 6                      | 6              | 6  | 1             | 8                   | 1  | 7   | 7                          | 7                |
|                                      |                       |  |  |                  |                              |                    |                        |                |  |               |                     |  |   |                            |                  |

|  |   |
|--|---|
|  | Incompatible roles                      |
|  | Potential conflict; requires mitigation |
|  | Compatible roles                        |

\*For the Advisory Deans, "advisees" includes all students in the Society. For the Associate Directors, "advisees" includes only the advisor's primary advisees. For the Dean for Students, "advisees" includes all students.

Note that Society Research Fellows advise students on research-related matters only, and students are free to choose a research fellow from outside their assigned Society.

1. This potential conflict is acceptable only if advisors are not responsible for determining final course/clerkship grades or writing final course/clerkship evaluations for their advisees. This can be accomplished by having the advisor teach and assess only in another Society (preclerkship phase), and/or having a course/clerkship co-director (not in an advising role) determine final grades/evaluations of the advisees (all phases).
2. This potential conflict is acceptable only if the advisor does not have advisees who are at the relevant POM/PCE site. This can be accomplished by assigning the advisor only advisees at other POM/PCE sites.
3. This potential conflict is acceptable only if the advisor does not interview HMS applicants and is recused from discussions and evaluations of HMS applicants.
4. The Dean for Students serves as a pro forma signatory of the MSPE but does not participate in its drafting.
5. This is not a potential conflict because PCE advisors do not serve in that role until after the student has completed the preclerkship phase.
6. This is not a potential conflict because specialty advisors do not serve in that role until after the student has completed the PCE phase.
7. While faculty member could serve in both these roles, they should disclose the potential conflict to the student and the Society advisor should identify a potential alternate Specialty advisor for the student.
8. This potential conflict is acceptable only if advisors are recused from discussions of their advisees during the committee meeting.
9. This potential conflict is acceptable only if advisors are not placed on a clinical team on which their advisees are rotating.
10. In the special case of the CIC site, the PCE director, who is completely non-evaluative, serves as the longitudinal advisor for all enrolled students. For all other PCE sites, this is an unacceptable conflict.
11. This potential conflict is acceptable only if the the tDP preceptor does not serve in that role until after the student has completed the preclerkship phase (e.g., a tDP2 preceptor but not a tDP1 preceptor).